

At the Special Meeting of the **WEST DEVON BOROUGH COUNCIL** held in the **COUNCIL CHAMBER, KILWORTHY PARK, TAVISTOCK** on **TUESDAY** the **24th** day of **JUNE 2014** at **11.00am** pursuant to Notice given and Summons duly served.

Present Cllr C M Marsh – The Mayor (In the Chair)

Cllr S C Bailey	Cllr R E Baldwin
Cllr M J R Benson	Cllr A Clish-Green
Cllr D W Cloke	Cllr C Hall
Cllr T J Hill	Cllr L J G Hockridge
Cllr A F Leech	Cllr J B Moody
Cllr N Morgan	Cllr M E Morse
Cllr D E Moyse	Cllr C R Musgrave
Cllr T G Pearce	Cllr P J Ridgers
Cllr R F D Sampson	Cllr P R Sanders
Cllr D K A Sellis	Cllr J Sheldon
Cllr E H Sherrell	Cllr D Whitcomb

Head of Corporate Services
Deputy Monitoring Officer
Democratic Services Manager

CM 20 APOLOGIES FOR ABSENCE

Apologies for absence were received from Cllrs K Ball, W G Cann OBE, M V L Ewings, D M Horn, Cllr J R McInnes, Cllr R J Oxborough, Cllr L B Rose and D M Wilde.

CM 21 DECLARATION OF INTEREST

The Mayor invited Members to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered during the course of the meeting, but there were none made.

CM 22 SENIOR MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE

A report was considered that made recommendations about the future senior management structure, the recruitment process, salary scales and the timetable for implementing the changes, as a further step to implementing the next phase of the Transformation Programme.

In discussion, reference was made to:-

- (a) the proposed two Executive Director model not being a wholly new concept. For example, such a model was in operation in other local authorities e.g. Wiltshire County Council;
- (b) the proposed salary figures having been extensively (and independently) benchmarked. Furthermore, it was noted that the recommendation to implement a salary range would provide a tool for negotiation with the successful candidates;

- (c) the financial implications. When questioned, the Leader advised that, since it was unknown how extensive the level of turnover would be within senior management, it was impossible to give an indication regarding the exact costs of the process at this time;
- (d) the number of risks outlined in the presented agenda report. Whilst recognising the number of risks, a Member wished to particularly highlight the potential loss of knowledge, continuity and experience and the potential time delays arising from external appointments being made;
- (e) the involvement of the wider membership in the process. Whilst unsure of the format, the Leader confirmed that there would be an opportunity for all Members to meet the shortlisted candidates during the selection process;
- (f) the proposed income generation role. Some Members expressed their disappointment that, following consultation, the income generation role had been removed from the proposed structure. To ensure that emphasis on income generation was not lost during the process, the following additional recommendation was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared to be **CARRIED**:-

'That the interview panel be mindful of the importance of potential income generation within the future organisation.'

- (g) information regarding the process. In expressing his reservations, a Member felt that the majority of Members were not sufficiently briefed on the finer details of the process, which he considered to be a cause for concern;
- (h) the proposed Member Panel. Assurances were given that each of the Panel Members would be made aware (and invited to attend) relevant meetings in the future;

It was then proposed by Cllr P R Sanders, seconded by Cllr R E Baldwin and upon being submitted to the Meeting was declared to be **CARRIED** and **RESOLVED** that:

1. the future senior management structure consist of two Executive Directors and four Service Leads, with the S151/strategic finance role also being recognised as an integral part of the senior management team;
2. an Executive Director model be operated, with one Director responsible for Strategy and Commissioning and one for Service Delivery and Commercial Development, the former to be Head of Paid Service;

3. two Executive Directors and four Service Leads be appointed;
4. the recruitment to the six senior management posts be through open competition, with the recruitment process to begin in July advertising for the two Director posts to appoint in September; Service Lead equivalent posts then filled by the relevant Director in October; Service Leads then to appoint the next tier of managers initially through an internal recruitment process by December 2014 in readiness for all other posts to be recruited to the T18 model in phases commencing January 2015;
5. iESE, as the Council's external advisors on the T18 Programme, provide an Interim Head of Support Services in July to enable Phase 1a to commence from October in tandem with the permanent senior recruitment process;
6. the appointment of the two Directors should be determined by a Member Panel of six, decided by the two Leaders – three from South Hams and three from West Devon. The Member Panel will also sit in on the appointments of Service Leads, with the ultimate decision residing with the relevant Director;
7. the two Director posts be advertised with a salary range of circa £88,000 to £96,000; the Service Leads to be advertised at a range between £61,000 to £66,000;
8. agreement of the formal job titles for each of the four Service Lead posts be delegated to the Head of Paid Service in consultation with the Leaders and Deputy Leaders of both Councils; and
9. the interview panel be mindful of the importance of potential income generation within the future organisation.”

CM 23

T18 HUMAN RESOURCE WORK STREAM

Members considered a report that informed of the progress made on the Human Resource work stream within the T18 Programme and which sought approval of a number of initiatives.

In discussion, reference was made to:-

- (a) the proposed monthly domestic allowance for permanent home workers. It was noted that the proposed allowance of £18 per month would ensure that the allowance was tax free (under HMRC guidelines);
- (b) a limit being placed on travel claims. When questioned, it was confirmed that there would be no mileage limit placed on the amount which a Mobile or Flexible worker could re-claim. However, it was felt to be an operational matter which would need to be monitored by managers.

It was then proposed by Cllr P R Sanders, seconded by Cllr R E Baldwin and upon being submitted to the Meeting was declared to be **CARRIED** and **"RESOLVED** that:

- (i) the Job Level Assessment Scheme and the resulting pay and grading structure as set out in Appendix C of the presented agenda report be approved and that any subsequent assessment of any role is delegated to the Head of Paid Service in consultation with the appropriate Head of Service or Service Lead;
- (ii) the IMPACT behavioural framework as set out in Appendix D of the presented agenda report be approved;
- (iii) it be agreed to establish the host organisation, with the naming of the host organisation being delegated to the Head of Paid Service in consultation with the Leader and the Deputy Leader of both Councils;
- (iv) the Domestic Allowance for home workers as set out in Section 5 of the presented agenda report be approved;
- (v) it be noted that all redundancies will be carried out under the existing provisions of the Council's Redundancy and Interest of Efficiency Policy".

CM 24

MEMBERS' ALLOWANCES 2014/15 – INTERIM REVIEW

Members reconsidered a report that presented the views of the Independent Panel on Members' allowances and, as a consequence, sought to determine the new Scheme of Members' Allowances for the 2014/15 financial year.

This matter was initially considered by the Annual Council meeting, during which the decision was taken to defer the matter to enable for a meeting to take place between designated Members and the Independent Panel (Minute CM 18 refers).

In discussion, reference was made to:-

- (a) the views of the Independent Panel Members in justification of their recommendations. Following the meeting with Panel Members on 19 June 2014, the Leader provided an update to Council on the reasoning behind their recommendations. Whilst the Panel Members listened to the views of those Members present, the Leader also confirmed that they were not minded to change any of their recommendations;

(b) the proposed 1% increase in Basic Allowance. A lengthy debate ensued on the merits of accepting the proposed increase or maintaining the Basic Allowance at the existing level. In support of the proposed increase, some Members highlighted the difficulties in attracting prospective candidates to stand for Council and made the point that the Basic Allowance had been frozen at the current level for a number of years. In support of freezing the Basic Allowance, other Members felt that any increase would be insensitive when considering the implications to staff of the Transformation Programme and considered that it would be appropriate to consider this issue during the upcoming full review with a new Panel. As a consequence of the discussions, an amendment was proposed to part 1 of the recommendation by Cllr T G Pearce, seconded by Cllr J B Moody as follows:

'That the Basic Allowance be maintained at the existing level of £4,092.48 for the 2014/15 Municipal Year.'

Following a lengthy debate, and in accordance with Council Procedure Rule 19 Part 5, a recorded vote was called for and was recorded as follows:-

For the motion (7): Cllrs Hill, Leech, Moody, Morgan, Morse, Musgrave and Pearce.

Against the motion (15): Cllrs Bailey, Baldwin, Benson, Clish-Green, Cloke, Hall, Hockridge, Marsh, Moyse, Ridgers, Sampson, Sanders, Sellis, Sheldon and Whitcomb.

Abstentions (0):

Absent (9): Cllrs Ball, Cann OBE, Ewings, Horn, McInnes, Oxborough, Rose, Sherrell and Wilde.

and the vote was therefore declared **LOST**.

(c) Vice-Chairmen roles. A Member expressed his disappointment over the Panel's ongoing view that it did not support Vice-Chairmen roles being entitled to claim a Special Responsibility Allowance;

(d) the establishment of a Working Group. Whilst noting the need for a new Panel to be appointed, some Members felt that a Member Working Group should be convened in due course to look at the scope of issues which the new Panel should be asked to consider. As a consequence, an additional recommendation was proposed by Cllr M J Benson and seconded by Cllr D K A Sellis as follows:-

“That an informal working group be established to look at the scope of the issues for the newly convened Independent Panel to consider in the future.”

It was then proposed by Cllr P R Sanders, seconded by Cllr R E Baldwin and declared **“RESOLVED** that

1. the revised Schedule A: Basic and Responsibility Allowances 2014/15 (as outlined at Appendix A to these minutes) be adopted with effect from the start of the 2014/15 Municipal Year and be in place until the Annual Council meeting in May 2015;
2. the Panel recommendations on allowances payable to members of town and parish councils be noted;
3. on behalf of the Council, a letter of thanks be sent to the Panel members for their thirteen years of service on the Panel;
4. it be noted that a new Panel, including if possible one Member with past local government experience, will need to be appointed to ensure continuity before the current Panel retire on 31 December 2014; and
5. an informal working group be established to look at the scope of the issues for the newly convened Independent Panel to consider in the future.”

(The Meeting terminated at 1.15 pm)

Mayor

SCHEDULE A

Basic and Responsibility Allowances 2014/15

Role	Multiple of Basic Allowance	Basic Allowance £ per annum	Special Responsibility Allowance £ per annum	£ Total
Basic Allowance (all elected Members)		4,133.40		4,133.40
Special Responsibility Allowances:				
Leader of the Council, Chairman of Resources and leader of the largest political group	Basic x 200%	4,133.40	8,266.80	12,400.20
Deputy Leader and Vice Chairman of Resources	Basic x 150%	4,133.40	6,200.10	10,333.50
Leaders of other political groups	2 x Basic Allowance / 31 x No. of Group Members			
Chairman of Audit	Basic x 90%	4,133.40	3,720.06	7,856.46
Chairman of Community Services Committee	Basic x 150%	4,133.40	6,200.10	10,333.50
Chairman of Planning and Licensing	Basic x 120%	4,133.40	4,960.08	9,093.48
Chairman of Overview and Scrutiny	Basic x 90%	4,133.40	3,720.06	7,853.46

Civic allowances (see paragraph 7 of the Scheme)

Civic Duty	£ Allowance
Mayor	3,000
Deputy Mayor	825